









## ACTION OF THE UNION DEBATING SOCIETY OF THE CARLISLE INDIAN SCHOOL.

INDIAN RIGHTS ASSOCIATION,  
1316 FILBERT ST., PHILA., PA.  
March 3rd, 1887.

In view of the fact that Dr. T. A. Bland, and other members of the Indian Defense Association, have done all in their power to prevent Senator Dawes' Land in Severalty bill from becoming a law; and, failing in that, seems now disposed to thwart, by various means, the efforts of those friends of the Indians who desire to see its wise provisions carried into successful operation, it is deemed expedient to reprint the following extract from the columns of the *MORNING STAR*. The assault made by Dr. Bland, through the columns of the *Council Fire*, upon Capt. Pratt and upon the Carlisle Indian School is doubtless intended as a blow at that policy which recognizes the Indian's right to manhood and which seeks to fit him for the responsibilities and privileges of American citizenship. Dr. Bland sees in Capt. Pratt and Carlisle a menace to the old tribal bondage of the Indian, and to that condition of isolation and dependence which it seems to be the Doctor's great aim to defend and perpetuate. As the extracts given below fully explain themselves further explanation or comment is unnecessary.

HERBERT WELSH,  
Cor. Sec. I. R. A.

From The Morning Star of February, 1887.

A special meeting was called by the President of the Society on the evening of Feb. 29th., to take some action concerning the statement, which was laid before them, made by the *Council Fire*, a paper published in the city of Washington. Having heard the statement and after some debate, it was decided to appoint a Commit-

tee of six, to make a report and to represent it to the Society at the regular meeting on Friday night, the 11th. inst., by resolution or otherwise, such answer as the Committee thought best to give that the Society should make to the *Council Fire*.

The following is the article published in the *Council Fire*, Feb. 1887:

"We are too much pressed for space to say much on this subject at present, but it would seem from the way that the Cherokees, Creeks, Choctaws, Chickasaws, and Seminoles have managed their affairs, that all the tribes would be better off if allowed to control their own affairs, and their own funds, under the advice of Trusted Missionaries and other white friends, whom they would allow to settle among them. They want their children educated, but they sometimes protest against our plans. They don't like to have their children carried off thousands of miles and put in schools under control of subaltern officers of the Army, whose rule is the iron rule of despotism. Indians never punish their children. They govern by love, not by fear, so wherever the story has gone among the tribes that for a petty crime Capt. Pratt sentenced an Indian boy to be whipped on his naked back in the presence of all the pupils of the Carlisle School, and to have the word thief posted upon his person in a conspicuous position, and be compelled to work in the public yard, chained to a block of wood for thirty days, and be confined in a dungeon at night—wherever this story has gone among the Indians they hesitate to have their children sent to school at Carlisle."

The Committee appointed was composed of Peter Powlas (Oneida), Richard Davis, (Cheyenne), Joel Tyndall, (Omaha), Carl Leider, (Crow), John D. Miles, (Cheyenne), and Samuel Townsend, (Pawnee).

The Committee met and after deliberation, made the following statement in answer:

1. That we as partly educated Indian young men belonging to various tribes, believe and our people believe that in order to elevate our race, we should get sufficient education, experience, and ability, and when that obtained, be able to manage our own affairs, and be able to

Recy  
244.5  
I 5  
1887

act for ourselves, and not be always dependent upon and under the direction of Missionaries, and other white friends. We can do it. We can stand on our own feet if we are given sufficient chances to get out into association and competition with the best civilization—in its education and business. We must have experienced civilized life. We must go where education is free. We must go where experience is broad. We must have the chance to observe and compete in all the affairs of the country. Where will we find education free and experience broad—find them thousands of miles away from the reservations. By these privileges we will learn enough to hold our own with the white men.

The statement made that our people object to sending their children thousands of miles to Carlisle has no foundation. The fact that our school is full and overflowing is a sufficient evidence that the parents are glad to send their children where good education is easily acquired.

The Editor of the *Council Fire* does not seem to have wit enough to see that in espousing the systems of the tribes he holds up examples, he kills his own statement. He knows very well that the most educated men among the Cherokees, Creeks, Choctaws, Chickasaws and Seminoles are those who were transported thousands of miles from home among the whites for education. What right has the *Council Fire* in seeking to deny us the privileges which it claims has worked so great good for them? Does he want an Indian to remain Indian forever?

That the Indians never punish their children as stated in the *Council Fire* is not true, for in that, as in many other things, they are very much like other people. They punish their children to better their characters as the whites do their children. Of all the sixty members of our Society, only ten say they were never whipped by their parents, when they did wrong; but our parents do govern by love when that will do, and when that will not do, they, like other parents, use stronger remedy.

We think it best that the full particulars of the case of the young man, whose punishment is referred to, should be given. The following were the charges and specifications against him. We omit his name.

CHARGE—Stealing.

SPECIFICATION 1st. In that he did on or about Sept. 15, 1885, go to the trunk of \_\_\_\_\_, a student of the school, and take therefrom a razor, the property of \_\_\_\_\_, and appropriated the same to himself.

SPECIFICATION 2nd.—In this that the said \_\_\_\_\_, did on or about Nov. 10th, 1885, go to the box of \_\_\_\_\_, a student of the school, and take therefrom a pair of Pueblo bracelets, the property of \_\_\_\_\_, and appropriated the same to himself.

SPECIFICATION 3rd.—In this, that the, said \_\_\_\_\_, did on or about Nov. 13th

1885, take from the over-coat pocket of \_\_\_\_\_, a pair of kid-gloves, the property of \_\_\_\_\_, and appropriated the same to himself.

SPECIFICATION 4th.—In this, that he, the said \_\_\_\_\_, did on or about Nov. 13th, 1885, go to the box of \_\_\_\_\_, and take therefrom a collar-button, the property of \_\_\_\_\_, and appropriated the same to himself. (Signed) W. P. CAMPBELL,

Disciplinarian.

Upon these charges a Court was opened as follows:

ORDERED:

A Court Martial is hereby appointed to convene in the Disciplinarian's Office on Monday Nov. 16th 1885, at 4 P. M. or as soon after as possible for the trial of such person or persons as may be brought before it, by the proper authority:

DETAIL FOR THE COURT:—1st. Sergt., Frank Lock, 1st. Sergt., Debet Cheyenne Chief, 1st. Sergt., Arnold Woolworth, 1st. Sergt., Richard Davis, Sergt. Samuel Townsend, Sergt. Frank Conroy, Sergt. William Fletcher.

By order of Capt. R. H. PRATT.

W. P. CAMPBELL, Disciplinarian.

When he was brought before the court, he plead "Not guilty;" but after more than a dozen witnesses he said he wanted to change his plea, and said he was guilty.

The Court found him guilty and gave the following sentence:

Sentence:—"\_\_\_\_\_ shall be whipped before all the companies of boys, and wear a block of wood with thief, shackled to his leg, for a period of one month, and stay at the Guard House at nights; and put him to hard labor such as cracking stones etc., for one month."

The sentence was duly executed. He was not whipped on his bare back as the *Council Fire* states.

If any young man engages in the same business again, we shall ask that the punishment above mentioned be doubled as we intend that such business is not going to exist among us. Whipping is a medicine, not only at our school, but among our people.

It is the opinion of your Committee that the *Council Fire* should give the name of its informant, in order that we may know and make it known by what kind of people it is guided in making allegations against the school.

Your Committee recommends that, if this paper be approved by the Club, every member who favors it, may sign his name and his tribe, and if any not in favor of it, may be given full opportunity to state their objections in writing over their signature, and that the said paper or papers be sent to the Editor of the *Council Fire* for publication, and that a copy be also given to the *MORNING STAR* with the request that it be published, and that

Recy 8727

copies of the STAR be sent to every Indian Agent and Indian School, and also to the parents of every pupil at this school.

SIGNED:—

Noah Lovejoy, Omaha;  
James B. Garcia, Pueblo;  
Mark Everts, Pawnee;  
Richard Davis, Cheyenne;  
Peter J. Powlas, Oneida;  
Carl Lejder, Crow;  
Edwin Schamandoah, Oneida;  
Frank Everett, Wichita;  
Otto Zotoni, Kiowa;  
John Londros, Winnebago;  
Howard Logan, Winnebago;  
Chas. D. Wheelock, Oneida;  
Lorenzo Martinez, Pueblo;  
Reuben Wolf, Omaha;  
Geo. Fire Thunder, Sioux;  
Levi Levering, Omaha;  
Wilkie Sharp, Pawnee;  
Henry Martin, Comanche;  
Joel Tyndall, Omaha;  
Abe Somers, Cheyenne;  
Paul Boynton, Cheyenne;  
Abram Platt, Pawnee;  
George Baker, Kaw;  
Stacy Matlack, Pawnee;  
Casper Edison, Arapahoe;  
William Tivis, Comanche;  
George W. Hill, Crow;  
Eli Sheridan, Omaha;  
John Miller, Miami;  
William Morgan, Pawnee;  
Ernie Black, Cheyenne;  
Luke Phillips, Nez Perce;  
Robert A. Horse, Sioux;  
Clay Ainsworth, Arapahoe;  
Benjamin Lowry, Winnebago;  
Richard Wallace, Crow;  
Samuel Johns, Nez Perce;  
Harvey Warner, Omaha;  
Kias Sioux Man, Cheyenne;  
Maurice Walker, Sioux;  
Theodore North, Arapahoe;  
Percy A. Kable, Cheyenne;  
Clayton Brave, Sioux;  
Joe Harris, Gros Ventre;  
Peter Cornelius, Oneida;  
William Brown, Sioux;  
Thomas Metoxen, Oneida;  
Jesse Paul, Nez Perce;  
Joel Cotter, Wyandotte;  
Stally, Navajoe;  
John Rocks, Sioux;  
Frank Lock, Sioux;  
Samuel Townsend, Pawnee;  
Chester Poe Cornelius, Oneida;  
Henry J. Kendall Pueblo;

# AN EDUCATED INDIAN ATTACKED BY DR. BLAND AND JUDGE WILLARD.

The following pointed letter from a full blood Kiowa, for five years a pupil at Carlisle, and now a student at Lincoln University, shows up well the lines upon which the real enemies of the Indian are

working and proves our work and position the true one. Educate all the Indian youth and they will take the best care of the Indian problem.

LINCOLN UNIVERSITY.

CHESTER CO., Pa.

Feb. 20, 1887.

CAPT. R. H. PRATT—MY DEAR FRIEND:—I will write to you and inform you that I am keeping good health since I saw you last and am trying to study hard—late at nights so that I may not be far behind my class. My time is now well employed. I am sorry to say my studies have been interfered with a good deal by going and coming but I hope to march forward with a new determination.

I sent the Kiowa and Caddo chiefs home last Thursday morning. Dr. Bland accused to be afraid of me and stole my chiefs several times in my absence and urged them not to accept the white man's civilization and Christianity, especially the "Allotment of lands," said he, "as a detriment to your people and I as a friend of yours, advise you not to be too hasty in accepting the allotments, because the moment you accept the proposition you are gone." Lone Wolf told me all this, and I told the chiefs that Dr. Bland is not the man they came to talk and listen to, "because," said I, "the Commissioner does not recognize him when he comes to his office."

Dr. Bland scolded me, because I allowed Capt. Pratt to call me before the people—a body of Indian workers—to show what a once wild Indian can become when put through the process of education. "If I were you," said Judge Willard, "I would not allow it."

I told them that "Capt. Pratt meant no harm when he called me and asked me to stand before the audience. He simply wanted to show that if one wild Indian can be educated, it is possible that all other wild ones can be educated. I will still allow him to tell to the people, that I was once a wild savage Indian, but now an educated Christian Indian, as Paul was once a hater and persecutor of the Christians, but afterward became a minister of the Gospel."

I was invited to speak at a missionary meeting held in the North Presbyterian Church, Washington, D. C. To my surprise, Dr. Bland was on the list as one of the speakers. He told his experience among the Indians and how the Sioux Indians named Dr. Bland "Big Bear" because of his bravery in fighting against the Government. Dr. Bland, in conclusion, made an appeal to the body of Christians, "Let the Indian live. Have respect for his religion, (worshipping idols) have respect for his rights. Allow him for few more years to roam over the plains as he has done in the past."

I was introduced as next speaker. I said that I was notified a day before I

meeting was held, therefore had not prepared a speech for them. But would, however, talk to them in my own way. I appealed to the audience, that the Kiowa Indians need a missionary among them, who will tell them about the white man's religion and urge them to abandon their mode of worship, and then I got so warmed up, that I jumped upon Dr. Bland. I said in substance: "Will the gentleman inform me who is about to destroy the Indian and why? Why would you respect and allow the Indians to worship the sun, the moon and have sun dance? What rights have the Indian that you must regard and respect? Is it drawing rations or what? The idea, you have allowed the Indian to remain an Indian for the last 395 years, and will you still allow him to roam another 395 years? Some one has advised my chiefs not to accept the white man's religion. Woe to that man. Is that the way our Saviour commanded us?"—"Go ye into the world and tell the heathen to continue their evil practices!"

In answer to a question asked me, I said, "There are about 4,000 Indians at the Kiowa Agency, and it will take a Peter to preach a day and a third to convert this 4,000." You may build walls around the Indian reservations, whose heights will reach the sky—for fear the Indian race might be Christianized and civilized. But I tell you, my friends, the believers of Christian civilization will surely march around the walls, that the Indian Defense Association has builded in the way of civilization, seven times, like Joshua of old and then and not until then you will see the walls fall and thus Christian civilization will prevail. If you must work for the Indian race, work right for him, do not ask him to send you some money because you are working for him."

Mr. Frank La Flesche spoke after I got through and I wish you could have heard him. I am little afraid A—— has written to some one, to tell Dr. Bland that you whip the Indian boys. I am very insulted, because Dr. Bland used your name in his dreadful paper—*The Council*

*Fire*. I cut the article out to send to you. Frank La Flesche asked me whether the statement was true, I said, "Yes, but the students deserved such punishment." I am sorry, because Dr. "Big Bear" means to use his pen against the Carlisle School and its honored founder. I hope you are well. I am your friend,

J. H. GIVEN.

P. S.—The National Indian Defense Association talk of having the Severalty Law repealed by next December. Ha! ha! ha! Fifty men fighting against the United States Government. They might just as well fight against the Almighty God, for allowing the white people to come to this country.

J. H. G.

#### Morning Star Editorial.

We give large space to the resolutions of our Debating Club, in answer to the *Council Fire's* attack on our system of punishing, for the reason that it affords opportunity to show the parents of our students, and the Indians among the tribes, that what they would desire themselves to have done with thieves who have crept into the school, their boys and the school authorities do. The system of trial by jury we have pursued from the beginning and our experience encourages us to continue its use. We think our course fully as humane and free from despotism, as the course of civil law in this state, which would have sent the young man to the penitentiary for three years and then turned him out a vagrant on society. As it is, notwithstanding the offences stated in the resolutions of the club, and others of like character which preceded it, and additional trial and conviction for a like offence since, the young man is to day enjoying all the rights and privileges the school affords, and we still have hope for him.









